

*Institutional Abandonment of Minority Women
in Israel Who Are Violence Victims*

TAL MELER* & MICHAL HISHERIK**

How to cite

Meler, T. & Hisherik, M. (2020). Institutional Abandonment of Minority Women in Israel Who Are Violence Victims. *Journal of Mediterranean Knowledge-JMK*, 5(1), 73-91. DOI: 10.26409/2020JMK5.1.04.

Retrieved from

<http://www.mediterraneanknowledge.org/publications/index.php/journal/issue/archive>

1. Author's information

* Zefat Academic College, Israel

** Beit Berl College, Israel

2. Author's contacts

Tal Meler: melert[at]zefat.ac.il

Michal Hisherik: mhisherik[at]hotmail.com

Article first published online: June 2020



- Peer Reviewed Journal

INDEXED IN
DOAJ

Additional information can be found at
[Journal of Mediterranean Knowledge-JMK](#)



ICSR Mediterranean Knowledge

Institutional Abandonment of Minority Women in Israel Who Are Violence Victims

TAL MELER* & MICHAL HISHERIK**

* Zefat Academic College, Israel

** Beit Berl College, Israel

Abstract

The obligation of the establishment to protecting women against violence is non-consensus and is sometimes conceptualized as a struggle for women-human rights. The present article deals with domestic violence against women from the minority groups of Palestinian and Ethiopian women in Israel, both part of patriarchal, collectivist societies, who suffer from poor civil status. Semi-structured interviews were held with Palestinian and Ethiopian women, as well as professionals in the social services regarding violence against women, including physical and economic violence, and accessibility to resources for protection against violence. Our findings expose both patriarchal repressive practices and official public policies that exacerbate the situation of women violence victims, expressed as hollow citizenship among Palestinian women and partially exclusionary citizenship among Ethiopian women who are part of the Jewish majority. Thus, policymakers should consider adapting violence prevention and treatment programs to minority populations, to make these resources available to all citizens.

Keywords: Palestinian women citizen of Israel, Ethiopian women, Adequate housing, Violence, Hollow citizenship, Partially exclusionary citizenship.

Introduction

The present article deals with domestic violence (including physical, sexual, psychological, and economic violence) against women from the minority groups of Palestinian and Ethiopian women in Israel, with far more cases than other populations. Palestinian and Ethiopian women in Israel, both part of patriarchal, collectivist societies undergoing changes influenced by global trends, suffer from poor civil status (as a national minority or immigrants, respectively). The obligation of the state institutional resources (the welfare system, the judicial system, public housing, etc.) to such women and their right to protection is under debate and is sometimes conceptualized as a struggle for women-human rights.

However, until recently, academic and public discussion has not considered the possibility that the state maintains tools and services for violence victims, which are inaccessible to them.

The debatable level of commitment of the state stems from the discourse of exclusion. Exclusion processes occur according to Jamal (2007) on three levels: political, economic, and social. Such exclusion renders citizenship meaningless. The concepts of “hollow citizenship” (Jamal, 2007) or partially exclusionary citizenship (Hisherik, 2017) refer to the fact that citizens are entitled to equal rights according to law, yet are unable to realize even the most basic of social rights, such as safety, food, shelter, and education. In their daily lives, these women are exposed to the disparity between the stated commitment of the state to their protection and their legal entitlement to relevant resources and services on the one hand and their vulnerability in practice on the other hand, reflected in continuous exposure to domestic violence.

The populations of Palestinian and Ethiopian women in Israel will be used in the present study to illustrate different types of violence against women in marginalized populations from the institutional perspective. The current article focuses on economic violence against Palestinian women and spousal violence against Ethiopian women. Both communities are patriarchal, collectivist, where individuals maintain close ties with the extended family and, honor is a key value (Hisherik, 2017; Kamir, 2002; Meler, 2017). Relations within families are typified by demands to suppress personal needs and prioritize the family collective in exchange for assistance and support (Sa'ar, 2007). In addition, the trends of change among Palestinian women and Ethiopian women sometimes lead to the strengthening of conservative trends, including the reinforcement of violence against women. Indeed, in general, researchers (Hassan, 1999; Hisherik, 2017; Meler, 2016; Raj & Silverman, 2002) argue that women of minority populations suffer from high rates of spousal violence compared to women of the majority group, in addition to a racist attitude by the majority. This racist attitude limits their ability to integrate into the employment market and work toward promoting their social position and freeing themselves from oppressive family settings.

1. *Dual Governance Policy*

According to the liberal tradition, the role of the state is to protect the lives of citizens and their security by establishing a general policy to reduce violence against women. However, policy examination shows that while the discourse in the Knesset (Israeli parliament) and its committees deals with the needs of women and the issue of violence against women, in the executive discourse, which consists of government decisions and programs, women and their unique needs are largely ignored (Hisherik, 2017; Meler, 2016; 2017). The partial response that women receive corresponds to global neoliberal trends in the welfare state model (Herbst-Debby, 2019; Sasson-Levy, et al., 2014; Katz & Safdie, 2010). Neoliberalism dictates policy-setting and priorities, primarily based on budgetary considerations and reducing the involvement of the state in various areas of life (implying meager welfare support to weakened populations), preferring to privatize public services. This results in the state renouncing its responsibility to its citizens, especially its disadvantaged citizens, the disintegration of social solidarity, the violation of human and socio-economic rights, and the trampling of workers and the social security of citizens.

Palestinian Women in Israel: Family Status and Gender Relations

Palestinians constitute a national minority in Israel (21% of the general population in Israel, ICBS, 2019a). They suffer discrimination and oppression by Jewish Israeli society and are deeply divided from it (Smootha, 2013). Palestinian Israeli women experience gender discrimination that permeates the patriarchal hegemony typical of Israeli and Palestinian societies in many aspects of life (Hassan, 1999; Herzog, 2010; Sa'ar, 2007).

Over the past three decades, familial, economic, educational, and sociocultural changes have been taking place within this group, for example, an increase in the age of marriage and in the rate of divorce, declining birth rates, greater participation of women in the work force, increased rates of higher education among women compared to men, and changes in traditional-patriarchal perceptions (Abu-Baker, 2016; Meler, 2017; Sa'ar, 2007). However, due to the collectivist ethos, Palestinian

society still does not encourage or approve of divorce. Several communities consider it unacceptable for a woman to live alone with her children. In the economic context as well, women frequently have to leave their husband's home penniless and receive no alimony. In addition, due to the neoliberal-related cutbacks in welfare, a substantial number of single-mothers face poverty, resulting in dependence on relatives and family networks (Meler, 2016; Herbst-Debby, 2019; Herbst-Debby, Meler., & Karkabi-Sabbah, 2019). In addition, the percentage of Palestinian women's participation in the labor force in Israel is lower than that of Jewish women.

According to the Financial Relations Law of 1973, whether the marriage ends due to divorce or the death of the spouse, each spouse is entitled to half the value of all the joint assets, excluding assets in their possession before the marriage or received by gift or inheritance during the marriage. However, while many Jewish couples in Israel buy their apartment during the course of the marriage, in Israeli-Palestinian society, it is an accepted practice of the man to build the house before marriage, and therefore it is considered his or his father's property. Thus, divorced or widowed Israeli-Palestinian women cannot benefit from the Financial Relations Law. Since joint property is not recognized in Islam (Layish, 1995), women are left defenseless under Islamic law as well as under Israeli law, which does not relate to gender or cultural rights to housing. When facing so many obstacles, the most common and accessible arrangement for divorcées is to live in the extended family household by returning to the family of origin.

Ethiopian Women in Israel: Family Status and Gender Relations

Immigration from Ethiopia to Israel began in the 1980s and continued in several waves. At the end of 2018, the population of Ethiopian origin in Israel numbered 151.8 thousand and constituted about 2% of the general population (ICBS, 2019b). In Ethiopian society, young women and girls undergo social processes to be submissive and cooperative, especially towards the man in the family (father/husband; Edelstein, 2011). In accordance, a woman's deviation from the behavior expected of her is interpreted as harming the honor of the man of the family, legitimizing violence against her as a means of education and a direct result of the woman's actions (Edelstein, 2011; Kasan et al., 2005a; Shoham, 2012). In fact, 71% of Ethiopian women have at some point in their lives suffered physical or sexual violence, the highest rate in the world (World Health

Organization, 2016). The community supports men's violence and often ostracizes the rogue woman (Haj-Yahai & Sadan, 2007), and only in extreme cases of violence, the woman can turn to the traditional institutions of the community leadership (the *Shmagaleh*), the family of origin, or extended family to receive support (Hisherik, 2017).

Further explanations for the high rate of violence are related to the difficulties experienced by Ethiopian immigrants upon and after immigrating to Israel. These difficulties stem from immigration-related stress (Schweitzer, Melville, Steel, & Lacherez, 2006) and the disparity between cultures. Ethiopian immigrants have had to move from a developing country and a collectivist society to a developed country and to an individualistic society that operates according to very different standards and conventions, changes that make many feel helpless. In addition, they also deal with racism and paternalism in Israeli society (Dahan-Caleb, 2017; Herzog, 1999a), including by the state institutions, creating a dependence of the immigrants on institutional support.

Economically, the immigrants were required to find a living even though they did not have adequate training for the Israeli employment market. As a result, many experience poverty and unemployment. Poverty and inability to support the family, and with them a lack of education, are risk factors for violence (see, for example, Ben-Porat, 2010; Kasan & Keidar, 2006; Raj & Silverman, 2002; West, 1998). Some feel that these feelings may intensify violence toward migrant women (Raj & Silverman, 2002) and even prevent women from contacting the authorities for help (Ben-Porat, 2010). Immigration has also changed the family structures, and some argue that changing gender roles have contributed to violence against women. However, the official status of Ethiopian women who immigrated to Israel is that of a citizen entitled to be part of the collective.

2. The Present Study

The present article aimed to broaden the understanding of how public policy affects domestic violence victims by cooperation with mechanisms of patriarchal oppression. In addition, we aimed to examine the extent of the commitment of the state to the prevention and treatment

of violence against women in order to protect its citizens. The discussion of violence against women highlights the concept of citizenship and the rights granted to civilian women from minority or migrant groups. We examined the question exercising rights derived from citizenship with a focus on protection and treatment of partner violence, including economic violence, and if necessary, rescuing the victim from such a relationship.

Methodology

The current article was based on a field study conducted during 2007-2018 among Palestinian single mothers in Israel and during 2013-2017 among Ethiopian women and employees of the relevant social services.

Palestinian Women

Semi-structured interviews were held with 32 widowed or divorced/separated Muslim and Christian Palestinian women aged 30-64 with children recruited through mutual friends or snowball sampling. Some interviewees lived with their children while others had married and left the home (16 in urban localities, 16 in rural ones). The group was heterogeneous regarding economic status, occupation (working in low-paid temporary jobs, earning an adequate livelihood, and working in the free professions), religion, and educational background.

Some interviews were conducted in Hebrew by a Jewish researcher and several in Arabic by a Palestinian interviewer residing in Israel. Interview language was selected according to the interviewee's command of Hebrew as non-native speakers, taking into account the implications of conducting interviews in a language other than the participant's native one (Meler, 2017). The participants chose the interview venue. The interviews were at least 60 minutes in duration.

Ethiopian Women

Semi-structured in-depth interviews were conducted with 18 abused Ethiopian women (married, separated, divorced, and widowed) and 23 officials at all levels in the social services for domestic violence prevention and treatment were interviewed. Some of the Ethiopian women did not master Hebrew, and many used both Amharic and Hebrew in their answers. Therefore, some interviews were conducted in Amharic with the help of an interpreter, a social worker from the community, with whom

they were familiar. Interview location was chosen according to the interviewee's preference and each interview lasted 90 minutes on average.

The study was conducted using a method of institutional ethnography, an innovative methodology allowing to examine how experiences of oppression are produced. The method requires the researcher to adopt the viewpoint of the margins of society, collect interviewee reports, and become aware of their experiences, and then examine the centers of power and control. The institutional ethnography approach has enabled gaining insight into the subjective perspective of victims of spousal violence in the Ethiopian community and mapping trends and processes in the institutional space dealing with the issue.

Additionally, we collected data from official publications and documents of the State of Israel: State Comptroller reports, minutes of Knesset committees on gender issues (including violence against women in 2005–2017) and government decisions, reports of the Knesset Research and Information Center, domestic violence prevention programs, and reviews of these programs. Analysis of these documents according to the principles of gender mainstreaming (Daly, 2005) reveals overt and covert discourse and rhetoric, which provide insight onto the way institutional power centers view disadvantaged populations and exclusion mechanisms.

Interview Analysis

The analysis employed a naive empiricist approach to the interview texts, in line with Grounded Theory as defined by Strauss and Corbin (1990), a method based on the discovery of inductive connections between the various units of textual meaning arising from the interviews. The content analysis deals with topics, words, phrases, and descriptions that emerged from the interviewees' statements and reflected their feelings and thoughts, especially those that they raised. This analysis involved the process of mapping content into basic categories and identifying the links between them. From a feminist perspective, through interviews with women, one can extract the limited resources available to them when violating the silencing imposed by their spouse on the domestic violence they suffer and the difficulties they face when seeking support for this violation. Thus, this study aims to allow the voices of violence victims to be heard (De Vault, 1999) and enhance the effectiveness of public policy in

various fields through the assimilation of gender-based thinking (Benjamin, 2014; Daly, 2005).

Findings

The interviews revealed that violence constitutes a major factor that contributes to divorce and accompanies married life. Evidence regarding violence on the part of husbands crossed social border and appeared in interviews with women who belonged to different social categories. In addition, as the interviews illustrate, the attitude of Israeli society as a whole and of disadvantaged women in particular regarding violence directed against women is still forgiving and illustrates the cultural impact of double morality vis-à-vis women. For women, this discourse defines the situations in which they may expect—or not expect—support, while establishing the limitation of its legitimacy.

Therefore, in this article, we sought to re-contextualize the crimes associated with so-called honor or tradition. The analysis of these crimes should not be based solely on cultural issues but should also examine the socio-economic and political context as well as legal forces and gender relations. Therefore, the present study focused on similarities and differences between the two populations of Palestinian women citizens of Israel and women of the Ethiopian Jewish immigrant community in Israel in terms of exposure to violence and their access to resources of protection against violence.

3. Palestinian Single Mothers Suffer Violence Related to Housing Shortage

In recent years an ever-increasing number of Palestinian women in Israel have been murdered, far surpassing their percentage in the population. In the popular press, almost all cases of murder of Palestinian women are labeled as honor killings. This term disregards the research typology according to which (Hasan, 1999) the murder of women by their partner or husband cannot be included in this analytical category. However, analysis of the data on Palestinian women murdered in Israel during 2011-2019 shows that 16 (~23%) of the 68 women murdered were divorced and 4 (25%) were murdered for their right to adequate housing (Haaretz, 2019).

However, murder is an extreme case of violence directed at women. Therefore, here, we focus on housing-related violence directed towards single women and divorced mothers as a representative form of violence. Gender analysis of the housing options available to them and their right to adequate housing is used as a prism to examine other areas of life (e.g., employment, spatial mobility, mobility processes, support and supervision relationships, security) concerning them and their children. Understanding the civil-socio-economic-cultural-family context enables to better understand processes that enable violence against women. Nur is a divorced mother who had to go back to her parents' home despite being a working woman. Her excerpt suggests that the demand for supervision often constitutes a life-threatening situation for a woman.

I am allowed to go out with girlfriends, but my brother has already told me, "If you sit in a cafe or restaurant with a man, I will break your skull and throw you out the window, and our parents will tell [everyone] that you have committed suicide." (Nur)

Nur's brother is younger than her, but once she has returned to her parents' home, he serves as a supervisory agent. In addition, Nur's excerpt indicates not only her brother's harsh attitude towards her and his status as a patriarch (in charge of her honor) but also that their parents are likely to cooperate with him against her.

Similarly, Zahara, who has been divorced for five years and moved back into her parents' home with her son, who was four at the time, described her situation:

I cannot stay in the family all the time. If, for example, my father gets angry, he vents his anger on my son. If my sister gets angry, I sense that my child is suffering. I also suffer when I come here [her parents' house], and vent my anger on my son, and he suffers. It is really hard, and sometimes I feel like I am about to collapse on the floor and die, and then I get up and give myself strength. Sometimes I feel infinite despair. (Zahara)

Zahara describes the extreme difficulties that arise from the circumstances of her living in her parents' house. The integration into her family of origin raises daily conflicts, that are sometimes unbearable. Her acute phrasing indicates that her conditions of living cause extreme suffering to her son and to her. Thus, in contrast to the ideal of a child growing up in an extended family where everyone takes part in raising

him, women like Zahara deal with a reality where the extended family does indeed take authority over the education of children, but it involves expropriating authority from their mother and exposing children to abuse and lack of maternal protection. Zahara's reference to death expresses her helplessness in the face of living in her family home that leads to difficult conflicts with her parents.

Widows are often exposed to economic violence, custody threats, and cultural and political dictates by the late husband's family:

I am not so involved in their lives [her late husband's family], and they take the children as they cook or go for a walk. They have also tried to take part in the children's education, but it did not suit me at all. On the contrary, it contradicted everything I wanted for my children. (Loraine, a 35-year-old Muslim mother of 2, a widow for 6 years, unemployed)

Loraine describes daily coping with her husband's family as an experience that combines support with supervision and intervention. However, she later adds that since she does not intend to remarry, she is not afraid to lose her children. As single parents, women with no academic and sustainable employment are forced to place themselves among the traditional-patriarchal structures, and often give up new relationships (at least in public) due to the tight supervision and fear of losing custody of their children.

Zaccia, a 64-year-old mother of 4 describes her struggles with her husband's family who wanted to forcefully marry her daughter to a man in the family to maintain the inheritance: "I refused and disagreed, and my daughters married whoever they wanted". Thus, women's experiences with family relationships of dependence and supervision, range from normative behavior to violence.

4. Ethiopian Women: The Journey to Liberation from the Cycle of Violence

The social implications of violence among immigrants are crucial for understanding the status of Ethiopian women. Because of community attitude, women are constrained by a deep fear of losing their social status and the support of their immigrant communities, often the only communities they know. They also fear various forms of violence, domination, and punishment by their husband and his family. All of these

are experienced in an atmosphere of racism, which increases their desire to hide the violence in order to prevent a negative image of their community. Some interviewees mentioned the saying “The belly is bigger than the entire world”, suggesting that the normative traditional view encourages women to hold back the pain. Those who approached the establishment had to face major social barriers. Only a few interviewees seemed to be familiar with available courses of action and have access to formal resources and relevant information.

The women interviewed in this study violated the code of silence. These women described contacting the authorities as a violation of the silencing code, but they said it was the beginning of a long and difficult process. Attempting to receive appropriate care and guidance may fail due to language barriers that cause inaccessibility or concern about authoritative spaces such as welfare or legal authorities. Similarly, legal challenges include being unfamiliar with social services and criminal justice systems. Even though the women took the first step and alerted the police, they did so with grave concern and tried to disguise the fact that they were the ones who called.

Many women described the beginning of the process with embarrassment and lack of knowledge. For example, Dalia, 37, mother of 4 children, violence survivor, said, “I needed help in filing for a divorce. I did not know anything about where to go. When I was new in the country, my neighbor told me where to go and brought me here [social services].”

Language barriers and a lack of Amharic-speaking professionals prevents women from receiving adequate service:

A month after [my husband's] death, I came to the [social services] center and asked for treatment continuation. I wanted support. I asked, “Who is substituting for Milly [the Amharic-speaking social worker]?” They said, “No one.” [...] My situation was really critical. This period could have been less difficult. (Simha, a 45-year-old widow, mother of six)

Language barriers have been noted as a major difficulty by most women and professionals. According to the social workers and welfare department managers interviewed, language accessibility and mental accessibility are part of cultural sensitivity.

[We] use the tools we have [...]. Can they cope [with their problems] in terms of language and accessibility? It is critical. Mental accessibility [is important] too, in terms of understanding. You can understand [what they say] but in a limited way. The language we learned to speak is different. They fail to convey their message clearly in terms of verbal choice and thinking [...]. When we speak in Amharic, I manage to connect with them and all the more when they describe violence. It requires a very complex process of shedding layers that is difficult for the general population and especially for women with a language barrier. (Ma'ayan, a social worker of Ethiopian descent)

Despite many women's language difficulties, there are no Amharic language information booklets with relevant and valid information on protection for victims of spousal violence for the target audience, and such booklets are available only in Hebrew. The Ministry of Welfare and Social Services has produced such booklets in 2007 and distributed them to the welfare agencies in the local authorities, but the information is not up to date. At the end of the State Comptroller's audit (Shapiro, 2013), an updated booklet has not yet been produced. Similar booklets in Arabic, Russian, and Amharic were produced in 2002 and have not been updated. The Women's Status Promotion Authority also produced similar booklets, the most recent ones printed in Hebrew in 2009 and in Arabic in 2011, and distributed to local authorities, family health clinics and other agencies without being updated. They included information on 68 of the 86 violence prevention centers that were active at the time of the audit (2012). At the end of 2016, booklets in Amharic had not yet been distributed and the Ministry of Welfare spokesperson said, "the matter will be re-examined in the hope that the budget will be found." In addition, the Inter-ministerial Committee on Coping with Murder and Violence Against Ethiopian Women Immigrants acknowledges that "the main difficulties in providing adequate services are language barriers, lack of professionals who speak the languages of the immigrants, lack of knowledge, ability, skills, and cultural competence" (The Inter-ministerial Committee on Coping with Murder and Violence Against Ethiopian Women Immigrants report, March 2013, p.8). Although the committee report was written in 2013, four years later, no resolution was taken to rectify the failures listed. These findings manifest dual governance: a declaration of intentions on the one hand and insufficient budget allocation on the other hand, for causes such as Information booklets in Amharic.

Ethiopian women, like Palestinian women, as single-mothers face poverty. Although economic growth continued in 2018, employment rates among single-mothers in Israel declined. Furthermore, their percentage of participation in the labor force in Israel is lower than that of native-born Jewish women. Furthermore, the women lack vocational training and work in part-time jobs, low-wage jobs (cleaning and care work) without job stability. Furthermore, in 2018, the welfare payments to single mothers were decreased, and the employment grant for working mothers was deducted in cases of women who increased their labor efforts. These findings suggest increased levels of permanent and more severe poverty among single-parent households (Endeweld, Gottlieb, Heller & Karady, 2019). As such, they and their children experience economic violence.

My son works and studies, buys clothes for himself. He wanted to quit school in order to work full-time and support us, he cares about me, but I do not want him to [quit school]. He is a good boy, thank goodness, and so are the little ones. When the little one wants me to buy her things her friends have, my eldest [...] explains to her that it is not possible right now [...] and she understands. It pains me. (Yael, in a divorce process, mother of three)

Discussion

In the present study, we examined domestic violence towards Palestinian and Ethiopian women in Israel in terms of socio-political status and government policies concerning women's protection against domestic violence, indicating the level of the state commitment to preventing violence against women.

Our findings show that official citizenship does not always imply stability and protection for women. The analysis revealed oppressive structures that prevent women from having full access to formal resources or challenging the socio-political structure and reshaping it, and thus, their citizenship is inherently exclusionary. According to Regev-Messalem (2015), the concept of citizenship is in line with feminist understanding of citizenship as a struggle to negotiate institutional definitions, pointing to the limitations of this struggle. The concept of citizenship excludes women in all discourses and defines characteristics of citizenship that leave parts of the population out of the collective. State and welfare policies create stratified citizenship, where women are at the lowest level, especially if

they belong to excluded groups, such as minority groups, immigrants, or women of low socio-economic status. Thus, our findings distinguish between Palestinian women, who suffer from partially exclusionary citizenship (as part of the Jewish majority) and Palestinian women, who suffer from fully exclusionary, “hollow” citizenship.

Realizing the rights derived from citizenship is dependent on various resources, and the literature distinguishes between informal resources (family, friends, community) and formal, institutional resources (welfare, the judicial system, etc.). However, this distinction does not necessarily reflect the range of resources abused women use (Barrett & St. Pierre, 2011), which is affected by their marginal position in society. In addition, responses to violence against women, at the family and community level as well as at the social institutions, contribute to the social organization of silencing (Clair, 1998). The interviewees who had already contacted the authorities had to deal with major social barriers. Attempting to receive appropriate care and guidance sometimes fails due to language barriers that create inaccessibility of information or concern about authoritative spaces such as welfare or legal authorities. Similarly, legal challenges include being unfamiliar with social services and criminal systems, as well as feelings of alienation and distrust.

The study shows that the State of Israel has dual governance, manifested in a discrepancy between the rhetorical level, in which the state declares a commitment to its citizens, and the practical level, which reveals abandonment. This discrepancy is reflected in the cultural bias of drafting regulations and laws and their unsuitability to women from certain ethnic-national-class positions, problem in decision making, budget allocation and utilization, and in some institutions in the removal of violence against women from the agenda. Such dual governance provides a partial solution that does not meet the needs of abused women and often relies on patriarchal mechanisms and empowers them. In some cases, there is also a discrepancy in the level of dedication among policymakers and between the scope of investment in solutions and the needs, which means that the allocated budgets are not realistic.

Regarding Palestinian women, in this paper, we take a critical view of Israel's conventional housing policies from a gender perspective, which takes into account the changes in Palestinian society in Israel, and especially the increase in single-parent families headed by a woman due to

divorce or widowhood. We present the analysis of these women, who belong to a social category that is subject to patriarchal cultural pressures and exclusion, alienation, inequality, and discrimination, due to their civil status. Focusing on the housing solutions they find due to the implications of Israel's public policies for these women, we show that these policies violate one of their basic human rights—the right to adequate housing (Meler, 2016).

This difficulty is unique to Palestinian women in Israel as part of their civilian and political status as belonging to the Palestinian minority. Despite being Israeli citizens, their institutional exclusion is explained by the fact that Palestinian nationalism leaves them outside the consensus of Jewish society (Herzog, 1999). However, as this article shows, Ethiopian women who are allegedly part of the Jewish national consensus, due to their gender-class ethnic marginality, have limited access to formal resources available to other Jewish citizens and experience discriminatory and racist attitudes. Therefore, while the state presents a neutral outlook, in practice it contributes to their exclusion.

The analysis reveals that although institutional structures present a neutral appearance, in practice, they contribute to excluding women through rhetoric and under the guise of a discourse purporting to promote equality principles. Women are underrepresented in both parliamentary debates and government decisions, which undermines their ability to represent their interests in asserting their social rights, leading to the exclusion of women from the discourse (Epstein, 2013).

When the state views the issue of violence against Ethiopian and Palestinian women as a matter of community, it attempts to solve a "community problem", not a problem of women suffering from violence and certainly not a problem of state citizens. Such a view may reinforce discrimination and the assumption that minority societies are failing societies and that women's oppression is part of culturally inherent patriarchal norms. Thus, the principle of multiculturalism allows the majority group to shirk responsibility for the women in minority groups. This view is consistent with Clarke's (2011) argument that addressing the issue of violence toward women in this way can also evoke hostile feelings towards that population (which already suffers from discrimination) and normalize violence among the majority group.

Our conclusions expose repressive practices and social structures that exacerbate the situation of women who already suffer from partially exclusionary citizenship, as established by official public policy, along with the patriarchal mechanisms of repression. Most of all, the importance of defining violence against women is a broad social problem that requires systemic treatment. On the basis of our findings regarding the similarities emerging from the marginal status of Palestinian and Ethiopian women, we list here concrete recommendations for policy makers in prevention and treatment of violence against women, including through legislation and enforcement. Prevention of violence should be done in educational frameworks, publicity in various languages, adult education programs, raising public awareness of violence against women as a non-normative action, and providing knowledge to women about their rights and opportunities to escape from violent frameworks. At the same time, the state needs to expand its services to protect civilians suffering from violence such as hotlines, women's shelters, increasing support for violence survivors, public housing, and vocational training that will enable women to integrate into the labor market and develop economic independence, while training professionals treating violence survivors of specific cultural needs. Regarding legislative and enforcement recommendations, we note the importance of expanding legislation prohibiting violence against women, including aspects of economic violence. In addition, it would be appropriate to establish a national agency that will review and monitor the prevention and treatment of violence over time.

To provide any substantive assistance to women who suffered violence, these conclusions and their practical recommendations should be adopted, thereby manifesting actual commitment to Palestinian and Ethiopian women and who suffer from the implications of partially exclusionary citizenship or hollow citizenship.

References

- Abu-Baker, K. (2016). Gender policy in family and society among Palestinian citizens of Israel: Outside and inside influences. In E. Ben-Rafael, J. H. Schoeps, Y. Sternberg, & O. Glöckner (Eds.), *Handbook of Israel: Major Debates* (pp. 453-474). Berlin: De Gruyter Oldenbourg.

- Almagor-Lotan, A. (2011). *Violence Against Women Data Concentration for 2011*. Submitted to the Committee for the Promotion of Women's Status. Jerusalem: Knesset, Research and Information Center, www.knesset.gov.il/mmm/data/pdf/m02959.pdf [Hebrew]
- Bauml, Y. (2010). 61 years of supervised abandonment: Decoding Israeli governmental policy toward Arab citizens. In H. Katz & E. Tzfadia (Eds.), *Abandoning State Supervising State: Social Policy in Israel, 1985–2008* (pp. 35-54). Tel-Aviv: Resling. [Hebrew].
- Barrett, B. J & St. Pierre, M. (2011). Variations in women's help seeking in response to intimate partner violence: Findings from a Canadian population-based study. *Violence Against Women*, 17(1), 47-70.
- Benjamin, O. (2014). The spirit of women working together: Ethics in feminist research. In M. Krumer-Nevo M., Lavie-Ajay & D. Hacker (Eds.), *Feminist Research Methodologies* (pp. 134-151). Tel-Aviv: Hakibutz Hameuhad. [Hebrew].
- Ben-Porat, A. (2010). Connecting two worlds: Training social workers to deal with domestic violence against women in the Ethiopian community. *British Journal of Social Work*, 40, 2485–2501.
- Clair, R. P. (1998). *Organizing silence: A world of possibilities*. Suny Press.
- Clarke, K. (2011). The paradoxical approach to intimate partner violence in Finland. *International Perspectives in Victimology*, 6(1), 9-19.
- Dahan-Caleb, H. (2017). Colorism in Israel - Hidden perspectives. *Political Science & International Relations*, (26), 69-102 [Hebrew]
- Daly, M. (2005). Gender mainstreaming in theory and practice. *Social Politics*, 12(3), 433–450.
- Daud, N. (2019). *National study of spouses' violence against Arab and Jewish women in Israel*. [Hebrew], <https://isf.org.il/layperson-reports/%D7%9E%D7%97%D7%A7%D7%A8-%D7%90%D7%A8%D7%A6%D7%99-%D7%A2%D7%9C-%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%99%D7%9E%D7%95%D7%AA-%D7%91%D7%A0%D7%99-20181223135812.html>
- DeVault, M. L. (1999). *Liberating method: Feminism and social research*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Edelstein, A. (2011). *Intimate partner homicide in Israel. Theoretical and empirical aspects*. BeerSheva, Ben-Gurion University Press. [Hebrew]
- Endeweld, M., Gottlieb, D., Heller, O. and Karady, L. (2019). Poverty and Social Gaps in 2018, annual report. National Insurance Institute of Israel. [Hebrew] https://www.btl.gov.il/Publications/oni_report/Documents/oni2018.pdf
- Epstein, W. N. (2013). Contract theory and the failures of public-private contracting. *Cardozo Law Review*, 34(6), 2211-2260.
- Gharrah, R. (2018). *Arab society in Israel: Population, society, economy (9)*. Jerusalem: Van Leer Institute, Hakibbutz Hameuchad. [Hebrew]
- Haaretz, (2019). *First degree murder*. <http://www.haaretz.co.il/st/c/prod/heb/global/homicide/>
- Haj-Yahai, M. (2000). Implications of wife-abuse and battering for self-esteem, depression and anxiety as revealed by the second Palestinian national survey on violence against women. *Journal of Family Issues*, 21, 435-463.
- Haj-Yahai, M., and Saden, a. (2007). Beating women in collectivist societies: Issues in intervention and empowerment. *Society and Welfare*, 27, 423-451. [Hebrew].
- Hassan, M. (1999). The politics of honor: patriarchy, the state and the murder of women in the name of family honor. In D. N. Izraeli A. Friedman H. Dahan-Kalev S. Fogiel-

- Bijaoui H. Herzog M. Hassan&H, Nave (Eds.), *Sex, Gender and Politics* (pp. 267-305). Tel Aviv: Hakibbutz Hameuhad. [Hebrew]
- Herbst-Debby, A. (2019). The economically responsible single mom who sees to her future: Welfare-to-work programs and pension savings. *Journal of Social Policy*, 48(3), 489-510.
- Herbst-Debi, A., Meler, T., & Karkabi-Sabbah, M. (2019). 'Deserving' and 'responsible' motherhood: Palestinian motherhood in Israel and welfare-to-work programs. *Society and welfare*, 39(1), 49-79. (Hebrew).
- Hertzog, E. (1999). *Immigrants and bureaucrats: Ethiopians in an Israeli absorption center*. New York. Oxford:Berghahn Books.
- Herzog, H. (1999a). Homefront and battlefield and the status of Jewish and Palestinian women in Israel. *Israeli Studies*, (3), 61-84
- Herzog H. (2010). Alternative spaces: Politics of the everyday life of Israeli-Palestinian women in mixed cities. In S. Abu-Rabia-Queder & N. Weiner-Levy (Eds.), *Palestinian women in Israel: Identity, power relations and coping strategies* (pp. 148-174). Jerusalem: Van Leer Institute, Hakibbutz Hameuhad. [Hebrew]
- Hisherik, M. (2017). *Violence toward Women in the Ethiopian Community: The Community's Culture, Intervention programs and Public Policy*. (Ph.D. thesis). Bar-Ilan University, Ramat-Gan, Israel.
- The Inter-ministerial Committee on Coping with Murder and Violence Against Ethiopian Women Immigrants report, March 2013, p.8.
- Israel Central Bureau of Statistics. (2019a). *Israel in figures - Rosh Hashana selected annual data 2019*.
https://www.cbs.gov.il/he/mediarelease/DocLib/2019/304/11_19_304b.pdf
- Israel Central Bureau of Statistics. (2019b). *The Ethiopian population in Israel*.
https://www.cbs.gov.il/he/mediarelease/DocLib/2019/355/11_19_355b.pdf
- Jamal, A. (2007). Nationalizing states and the constitution of 'hollow citizenship': Israel and its Palestinian citizens. *Ethnopolitics*, 6(4), 471-493.
- Kamir O. (2002): *Feminism, rights and the law*. Tel Aviv: Israel Ministry of Defense. [Hebrew].
- Kasan, L., Sofer, J. and Kidder, L. (2005). Spouse violence among Ethiopian immigrants in Israel. In Sabtai, M. and Kasan, L. (Eds.), *Molemole: Women and Girls Exiting Ethiopia in Spaces, Worlds, and Cultural Journeys* (pp. 135-111). Tel Aviv: Lashon Zhacha.
- Kasan, L., & Kidder, L. (2006). *The stomach is wide until it explodes - spousal violence among Ethiopian immigrant families in Israel*. Beer-Sheva: Ben-Gurion University Press. [Hebrew]
- Katz, H., & E. Tzfadia. (2010) *Abandoning state supervising state: Social policy in Israel, 1985–2008*. Tel-Aviv: Resling. [Hebrew].
- Layish, A. (1995) "Introduction" Islamic law and society. *Marriage, Divorce and Succession in the Muslim Family*, 2(3), 215–218.
- Meler, T. (2016). Economic violence towards Palestinian Israeli women. *International Journal of Innovative and Applied Research*, 4(6), 22-34.
- Meler, T. (2017). "The Palestinian Family in Israel: Simultaneous Trends". *Marriage & Family Review*, 54(8), 781-810.
- Mizrahi-Simon, S. (2015). *Violence Against Women - Data Concentration for 2015*. Jerusalem: Knesset, Research and Information Center.[Hebrew]
- Raday, F. (2012). Gender and democratic citizenship: The impact of CEDAW. *International Journal of Constitutional Law*, 10(2), 512–530.

- Raj, R., & Silverman, J. (2002). Violence against immigrant women: The roles of culture, context, and legal immigrant status on intimate partner violence. *Violence Against Women, 8*, 367–398.
- Regev-Messalem, S. (2015). Changes in the welfare state and citizenship boundaries: exclusion of poor women. *Labour Law and Social Security, (14)*, 115-140[Hebrew].
- Sa'ar, A. (2007). Contradictory location: Assessing the position of Palestinian women citizens of Israel. *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies, 3* (3), 45-74.
- Sasson-Levy, O, Shavit, Z., & Ben-Porat, G. (Eds.). (2014). *Points of reference: Changing identities and social positioning in Israel*. Van Leer Jerusalem Institute and Hakibbutz Hameuchad.
- Schweitzer, R., Melville, F., Steel, Z., & Lacherez, P. (2006). Trauma, post-migration living difficulties, and social support as predictors of psychological adjustment in resettled Sudanese refugees. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry, 40*(2), 179-188.
- Shapiro, Y. H. (2013). *State Comptroller's Report. Reports on Auditing in Local Government for 2011-2012* (pp. 19-66). Jerusalem: State Comptroller's Office.
- Shoham, E. (2012). *A glimpse behind the walls: Violence towards women in segregated communities*. Beer-Sheba: Ben-Gurion University Press. [Hebrew]
- Siim, B.&Borchorst, A. (2017). Gendering European welfare states and citizenship: Revisioning inequalities. In P. Kennett P & N. Lendvai-Bainton (Eds.), *Handbook of European social policy* (pp. 60-87). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Smooha, S. (2013). *Still playing by the rules. Index of Arab-Jewish relations in Israel 2013. Findings and conclusions*. University of Haifa: The Israel Democracy Institute.
https://www.academia.edu/31576103/Still_Play_by_the_Rules_Index_of_Arab-Jewish_Relations_in_Israel_2015
- Strauss, A. L., & Corbin, J. M. (1990) *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Vertovec, S. (2007). Super-diversity and its implications. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 30*(6), 1024–1054.
- West, C. M. (1998). Lifting the "political gag order": Breaking the silence around partner violence in ethnic minority families. In J. L. Jasinski & L. M. Williams (Eds.), *Partner violence: A comprehensive review of 20 years of research* (pp. 184-209). Thousand Oaks, London, New Delhi: Sage publications.
- World Health Organization. (2016). *Violence against women*.
<http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs239/en/>